

## RESPONSES TO VILLAGE STAFF MAY 1, 2018 COMMENT LETTER

### Zoning:

The following zoning approvals will be required:

- PUD Approval: All development in the B-5 Downtown District is required to obtain Planned Unit Development approval. **AGREED**
- Rezoning: The three southern-most lots along Highland and the one southern-most lot on Chestnut that are part of this project will require rezoning from R-3 to B-5. **AGREED**
- Land Use Variation: From Section 28-5.5-3, Permitted Uses Table, Residential, to allow an Apartment Building or Multiple Family Dwellings in the B-5 District (for the 33 Chestnut Building). **AGREED**
- Variations:
- From Section 5.1-14.1, Conditions of Use, to allow dwelling units below the 2nd floor (for the 33 Chestnut Building). **YES**
- From Section 5.1-14.6, Minimum Required Yards, to reduce the rear yard setback (south) from 25' to 14'-4" for the 44 S. Highland Building. **YES. THE CURRENT PLAN SHOWS A REAR YARD SETBACK OF 13'3' TO MATCH WITH THE SOUTHERN EXTERIOR WALL OF THE VAIL STREET PARKING DECK**
- From Section 11.8, Schedule of Loading Requirements, to reduce the number of required loading spaces. **THIS VARIATION WILL NOT BE NECESSARY AS WE ARE MODIFYING OUR PLANS TO PROVIDE FOR LOADING THAT WILL MEET CURRENT CODE REQUIREMENTS**
- As proposed, there are certain setback variations required along Chestnut Avenue, which staff is asking for compliance on. **DUE TO THE CURRENT REQUIREMENTS OF ADDITIONAL RIGHT-OF-WAY, AND IN ORDER NOT TO CREATE A "CANYON" EFFECT BETWEEN THE HIGHLAND AND CHESTNUT BUILDINGS, WE WILL NEED A SETBACK VARIANCE ALONG CHESTNUT.**
- Additional variations may be identified when detailed plans are submitted. **UNDERSTOOD**

### Right of Way Dedication and Density

1. Please note that 8' of right-of-way must be dedicated along Chestnut Avenue. **WE WOULD PREFER TO GRANT A PERPETUAL EASEMENT FOR THE RIGHT OF WAY RATHER THAN A DEDICATION IN ORDER TO NOT LOSE LAND AREA AND THUS HAVE TO POSSIBLY REDUCE THE DENSITY OF UNITS ON THE SITE**
2. Staff is evaluating whether 8' of right-of-way will also be required along Highland Avenue. **IN LIGHT OF THE LOCATION OF THE VILLAGE GARAGE, WE BELIEVE THAT IT WOULD BE INCONSISTENT TO REQUIRE A SETBACK ON THE BALANCE OF HIGHLAND, ESPECIALLY WHEN WE WERE REQUESTED TO MOVE THE CAMPBELL BUILDING EAST, WHICH WE HAVE DONE**
3. Please revise the density calculations to take into consideration the loss of land that will be required for the 8-foot right-of-way dedication along Chestnut. If only 8' of right-of-way is required on the Chestnut side, then additional density could be added to max out on code requirements. If right-of-way dedication is required along both streets, the loss of lot area will require the density to be reduced to comply with code requirements. **PLEASE SEE THE PREVIOUS RESPONSES TO THIS ISSUE**

### Subdivision:

1. Please clarify if the site will be subdivided into individual lots for each building in the PUD, or if the site will be consolidated for an overall PUD. **ONE LOT PUD**
2. The development will need to establish easements or covenants that govern shared

access and shared parking if portions of the site are intended to be sold to multiple owners. **AT THE PRESENT TIME THERE IS NO INTENT TO HAVE MULTIPLE OWNERS**

3. If subdivision is proposed, details will need to be provided on how each lot conforms to the density and parking requirements. **A MULTI-LOT SUBDIVISION IS NOT PROPOSED**
4. Depending on the design and layout of any future subdivision, additional variations may be required. **UNDERSTOOD**

#### **Building Height:**

1. The Downtown Master Plan that was adopted in 2007 calls for the block to be developed in a cohesive manner with the northern three-quarters of the block designated with a height limit of 6-8 stories and the southern quarter of the block being 4-6 stories in height (see attached plan extract). While the Chestnut and Campbell buildings are consistent with this plan, the proposed building along Highland Avenue is inconsistent with the Downtown Master Plan. This building will need to be carefully analyzed in order to determine if its height is suitable for this block. The complete Downtown Master Plan can be viewed at [www.vah.com](http://www.vah.com). **THE ADDITIONAL HEIGHT IS NECESSARY AS A RESULT OF THE VAIL STREET GARAGE GOING UP TO OUR PROPERTY LINE (AND BEYOND). IT IS NOT FEASIBLE TO CONSTRUCT ANY DWELLINGS OR RETAIL USES ALONG HIGHLAND IN THE FACE OF THE VAIL STREET GARAGE, AND THE ONLY FEASIBLE USE IS A PARKING DECK. THUS, WE HAVE LOST VALUABLE AREA FOR THE CONSTRUCTION OF UNITS. THE ONLY WAY TO COMPENSATE FOR THIS LOSS IS TO BUILD A STRUCTURE ABOVE THE PARKING DECK, THAT WITH THE CODE AUTHORIZED ALLOWANCES, WILL BE UNDER THE MAXIMUM HEIGHT LIMITATIONS IMPOSED BY VILLAGE CODE**
2. Please provide an analysis on outlining which height bonuses were used to obtain the proposed 137'-6" building height for the Highland building in order to determine compliance with the B-5 density bonus requirements. **WILL PROVIDE**

#### **Setbacks:**

1. Given the required 8-foot right-of-way dedication along Chestnut Avenue, the 33 Chestnut building does not comply with the required 20-foot setback along this street. Please revise the building to conform with the required 20' setback along this elevation. **PLEASE SEE OUR PREVIOUS ANSWERS TO THIS ISSUE**
2. Depending upon how the property is subdivided, a setback variation may be needed for the Campbell building along the western elevation as well. **ONE LOT; NOT APPLICABLE**
3. Please shift the Campbell building 5' to the east to provide for additional a larger setback on the west side. This building setback will need further review. **WE ARE RELUCTANT TO SHIFT THE CAMPBELL BUILDING TO THE EAST. IT CURRENTLY HAS A 15' SETBACK ON BOTH HIGHLAND AND CHESTNUT. THIS IS ONE OF THE REQUESTED VARIANCES. IF THIS BUILDING IS SHIFTED TO THE EAST IT WILL HAVE A SIGNIFICANT IMPACT ON THE SETBACK ALONG HIGHLAND.**

#### **Parking/Loading/Traffic:**

1. A traffic and parking study will be required to assess the traffic impact of the proposed development and adequacy of proposed parking supply. **IN PROGRESS** As proposed, parking meets the B-5 requirement, however, based upon Arlington Heights data, 1.5 parking spaces per unit will be required, plus parking to meet all requirements for the commercial portion of the development. Staff will further evaluate based upon complete submittal and an analysis of prior parking ratio's used throughout Downtown. **WE ARE PROVIDING MORE THAN 1.5:1 PARKING**
2. Please reevaluate the ingress/egress of the Chestnut building onto Chestnut Avenue to determine if alternatives exist that could distribute traffic to be less of a disturbance to the nearby residential areas. **WE HAVE LIMITED THE NORTHERN ACCESS TO NO INGRESS AND FOR**

**NORTHBOUND EGRESS ONLY. TERE WILL BE NO ACCESS TO THE NEW PARKING DECK FROM CHESTNUT. THE ONLY INGRESS AND FULL EGRESS ON CHESTNUT BE TO EXCLUSIVELY SERVE THE SMALLER CHESTNUT BUILDING**

3. Additional details are needed on how trash collection, deliveries, and move-ins/move-outs will function, for both the commercial and residential uses proposed. **WILL PROVIDE DETAILS FOR PLAN COMMISSION. THE ABOVE REFERENCED FUNCTIONS WILL BE INTERNAL**
4. Staff will also need additional details on the garage ramp to the Chestnut building in order to ensure that the knee walls on the garage do not obstruct visibility triangles. **WILL PROVIDE WHEN AVAILABLE. THERE WILL NEED TO BE FULL COORDINATION IN SECERAL AREAS BETWEEN THE VAIL STREET PARKING DECK AND THE NEW DECK WE ARE CONSTRUCTING.**
5. Currently, no handicap-accessible parking stalls are shown in the proposed garage, and at least 11 spaces will be required. **OF COURSE, CODE REQUIRED HANDICAP SPACES WILL BE ADDED TO FINAL PLAN WHEN PRESENTED**
6. The traffic study should analyze if a loading/delivery space may be needed on Campbell street at the front entrance to the Campbell Street building. **WILL PROVIDE AS A PART OF THE TRAFFIC STUDY**
7. The traffic study must analyze roadway system impacts & ingress/egress at the Highland Avenue garage entrance. **IT WILL**

#### **Market Demand:**

1. A market study will be required to assess the need for the proposed quantity of dwelling units in this location. **THE MARKET STUDY IS CURRENTLY BEING FINALIZED**

#### **Site Related:**

1. Please accommodate for a Downtown "gateway" sign at the northwest corner of the site. Maintenance of this sign should be the responsibility of the developer. **WE WILL WORK WITH OUR LANDSCAPE ARCHITECT AND STAFF TO IMPLEMENT THIS RECOIMMENDATION.**
2. The front entry of the Campbell Street building appears to have a canopy that encroaches into the Village right-of- way, which will require review and approval of an indemnification agreement with the Village. **THE CANOPY NEEDS TO REMAIN AS DESIGNED AND AN INDEMNIFICATION LETTER, SIMILAR TO THAT FOR THE BALCONIES WILL BE PROVIDED.**
- 3.

#### **Landscape/Streetscape:**

**WE HAVE ENGAGED HITCHCOCK DESIGN GROUP AND WILL PRESENT FULL LANDSCAPE AND HARDSCAPE PLANS INCORPORATING THE FOLLOWING ITEMS.**

1. The developer will need to work with the Village to develop appropriate streetscape improvements along Highland, Campbell, and Chestnut in conformance with the Village's Downtown streetscape program.
2. Along Chestnut abutting the Campbell building, a reduced version of the Downtown streetscape may be appropriate, and further down Chestnut the streetscape may be the standard sidewalk/parkway abutting the Chestnut building (this will be further evaluated by staff).
3. Details will be required on the plantings above the basement garage to determine how landscaping will be suitable in this courtyard area.

#### **Parking Garage Structure**

**THE ISSUES SET FORTH BELOW ARE OF CONCERN TO ALL PARTIES AND WILL**

## **BE DISCUSSED AND PLANNED IN GREAT DETAIL.**

1. Please provide additional details of the proposed garage structure:
  - a. Methods of design and construction of sufficient design detail so as to not compromise the Village parking garage. **T**
  - b. How will the Vail Avenue garage be protected?
  - c. How will maintenance of the garage occur in the future?
  - d. A structural review of the existing Vail Avenue garage and proposed garage will be necessary.

### **Site Engineering/Utilities/Fire Access:**

1. All stormwater detention must comply with all MWRD and Village standards and must be accommodated on-site. Please review and evaluate this early on in the design process as there is limited space onsite to accommodate stormwater. **COMPLETED AND DESIGNED. ALL STORMWATER DETENTION WILL BE ON-SITE**
2. Preliminary utility information should be provided for further review. **WILL PROVIDE WITH PRELIMINARY ENGINEERING**
3. Fire access is a major concern for the 12-story building. As proposed, the fire access is minimal and insufficient. A meeting with the Building, Planning, and Fire Department is recommended to discuss fire department access to the site. **PLANS HAVE BEEN REVISED TO ALLOW FULL ACCESS AND APPROPRIATE TURNING RADII FOR VILLAGE FIRE TRUCKS. WE WILL CONTINUE TO WORK WITH FIRE DEPARTMENT AND STAFF TO CONFIRM AND FURTHER REVISE IF NECESSARY**
4. The Fire Dept. will review this project when additional details are provided, including a Fire Truck turning radius exhibit, FDC locations, fire access lanes shown on the site plans, and details on construction types and overhead utility lines. **SEE ANSWER TO #3 ABOVE**
5. All utility equipment and transformers will need to be appropriately located. **WILL BE INCLUDED IN PRELIMINARY ENGINEERING**
6. A plan outlining the burial of overhead utility lines shall be required as part of this development for further evaluation by the Village. **UNDERSTOOD**

### **General Details:**

1. Please provide FAR calculations, building lot coverage data, and impervious surface coverage data. **WILL PROVIDE** If lot is to be subdivided, please provide this calculation based on both the overall PUD and each lot within the PUD. **NOT APPLICABLE**
2. Please provide additional details on project phasing. **WILL PROVIDE WHEN AVAILABLE. CURRENT PLAN IS TO BUILD THE CAMPBELL BUILDING; AND THE HIGHLAND BUILDING (AND PARKING DECK) SIMULTANEOUSLY; THE CHESTNUT BUILDING WILL BE THE FINAL BUILDING.**
3. Affordable housing per the Village's Multi-Family Affordable Housing Policy will be required. A fee in lieu of providing the affordable units is also acceptable. Please provide a response to the policy within any Plan Commission application. **WE WILL FULLY COMPLY WITH VILLAGE CODE IN EFFECT AT THE TIME WE PROVIDE BUILDING PLANS. WE WILL SPECIFICALLY PROVIDE AFFORDABLE UNITS RATHER THAN FEE IN LIEU. THIS IS A VERY SIGNIFICANT ISSUE FOR THE OWNER**
4. Impact Fee's will be required for the residential units. **UNDERSTOOD.**
5. Details shall be required for any proposed restaurant spaces and outdoor dining areas. Please design the building to anticipate the future location of restaurant mechanical and exhaust equipment. **YET TO BE DETERMINED. WE ANTICIPATE A RESTAURANT AT THE NORTHEAST CORNER OF THE SITE IN THE CAMPBELL BUILDING. SITE PLAN HAS BEEN DESIGNED TO ACCOMMODATE OUTDOOR SEATING AT THIS LOCATION. FINAL BUILDING PLANS WILL**

## **INCORPORATE NECESSARY MECHANICAL, PLUMBING AND EXHAUST SYSTEMS TO ACCOMMODATE ANY RESTAURANT USES**

### **Building Design/Architecture:**

#### *General Comment:*

1. An overall massing model showing the proposed buildings with the surrounding context on all sides should be provided. **WE WILL PROVIDE A MASSING MODEL AS A PART OF OUR DESIGN REVIEW SUBMISSION.** Multiple birds eye views and street level perspectives should be provided to illustrate how the massing of the proposed buildings will fit in with the context of both Downtown buildings and the adjacent residential neighborhood. **PREPARED AND SHOWN AT THE PUBLIC OPEN HOUSE AND ARE INCLUDED IN THIS SUBMISSION**

#### *North Building (Campbell Street):*

1. Overall, the design is very nicely done. It has a rich appearance that will add to the quality of the Downtown. The colors and materials are nicely coordinated, and the overall composition is well balanced. The design will fit very well with the context of the adjacent 8-story buildings. **THE DEVELOPMENT TEAM AGREES WITH STAFF, AND NO SUBSTANTIAL CHANGES ARE CONTEMPLATED AT THIS TIME.**

2. Stepping down the massing of the building on the west end is encouraged to ease the transition to the adjacent residential neighborhood. **THE OWNER PREFERS TO KEEP THE BUILDING AS DESIGNED WITHOUT STEPPING DOWN THE WEST END. WE ARE AWARE THAT MULTI-FAMILY PARCELS EXIST IMMEDIATELY WEST OF THIS BUILDING AND THAT 8-STORY BUILDINGS EXISTING NORTH AND EAST. STEPPING DOWN THE WEST END WITHOUT RAISING THE EAST END WOULD RESULT IN A LOSS OF UNITS, AND WE CURRENTLY MEET THE ALLOWABLE UNIT COUNT FOR THIS PARCEL.**

3.

#### *West Building (Chestnut Avenue):*

1. Overall, the proposed design has a traditional style and character that is appropriate with the context of the adjacent residential neighborhood. The sloped roof and gable features work well to relate to the adjacent houses. **THE DEVELOPMENT TEAM AGREES WITH STAFF, AND NO SUBSTANTIAL CHANGES ARE CONTEMPLATED AT THIS TIME.**

2. The arched entry feature is large and out of scale with the adjacent residential neighborhood.

i. Consider replacing the arched feature with a gabled portico to help relate to the adjacent residential context and scale, and tie in with the gables at the top of the building. **THE DEVELOPER WILL WORK WITH STAFF AND ULTIMATELY THE DESIGN COMMISSION TO SETTLE ON AN APPROPRIATE ENTRY FEATURE FOR THE BUILDING. THE ARCHED ENTRY CAN BE REPLACED WITH A LESS DOMINANT FEATURE.**

3. The west wall is tall and flat. Consider the following suggestions to break down the scale of the wall and help relate to the adjacent residential neighborhood: **WILL WORK WITH STAFF ON THESE ITEMS AND WILL REVISE WHERE POSSIBLE.**

i. Widen/expand the covered porches across the first floor to create a one-story massing that relates to the scale of the residential neighborhood. **FRONT PORCHES ALONG CHESTNUT WILL BE EVALUATED AND POTENTIALLY EXPANDED IN ORDER TO RELATE WELL WITH THE ADJACENT RESIDENTIAL NEIGHBORHOOD.**

ii. Add the vertical box bay detail from the east elevation onto the west elevation. Consider limiting the height of the bays to two or three stories. **ADDITIONAL BAY DETAILS CAN BE CONSIDERED ON THE WEST ELEVATION. WE WILL WORK WITH STAFF AND THE DESIGN COMMISSION FOR AN APPROPRIATE SOLUTION.**

iii. Consider partially recessing all of the balconies to break up the flat wall. **THE UNITS**

**IN THIS BUILDING ARE THE LARGEST OF THE THREE BUILDINGS, AND COULD ACCOMMODATE A SLIGHT RECESS FOR THE BALCONIES. WE WILL WORK TOGETHER WITH STAFF AND THE DESIGN COMMISSION TO RESOLVE.**

4. It is recommended that the cornice detail be continued on the north elevation. **USING TWO DIFFERENT BRICK COLORS AS WELL AS DIFFERENT ROOF LINES AND CORNICE DETAILS WAS DONE PURPOSEFULLY TO VISUALLY BREAK UP THE MASSING OF THE BUILDING INTO SMALLER COMPONENTS. WE CAN CERTAINLY RE-EVALUATE CORNICE DETAILS AND ADJUST AS NECESSARY.**

The entrance ramp to the parking garage could be enhanced with decorative piers and carriage lights to complement the architecture of the building. **WE AGREE THAT THE ENTRANCE RAMP WOULD BENEFIT ARCHITECTURAL CHARACTER WITH RAILINGS, CARRIAGE LIGHTS AND DECORATIVE PIERS TO ENHANCE THE BUILDING. WE WILL WORK CAREFULLY ON THESE DETAILS IN ORDER TO AVOID VISUAL SIGHT ANGLE OBSTRUCTIONS.**

*East Building (Highland Avenue):*

1. The design of the new parking garage levels works well with the existing parking garage architecture. **THANK YOU**

i. Overall, the residential tower portion of the building works well with the garage and surrounding context, but the glass curtain walls on the north and south ends should be better coordinated with the garage below. **THE ENTIRE DEVELOPMENT IS DESIGNED AS A UNIFIED CAMPUS WITH THREE "SISTER" BUILDINGS. EACH BUILDING IS UNIQUE AND SLIGHTLY DIFFERENT FROM THE OTHERS, BUT HAS SIMILAR QUALITIES AND CHARACTER WHICH TIES THE FAMILY OF BUILDINGS TOGETHER. THE CHESTNUT BUILDING IS THE MOST TRADITIONAL AND RESIDENTIAL-STYLED BUILDING IN ORDER TO MARRY ITSELF APPROPRIATELY WITHIN THE FABRIC OF THE SURROUNDING RESIDENTIAL NEIGHBORHOOD. THE CAMPBELL BUILDING IS A MORE RECOGNIZABLE 8-STORY STRUCTURE AMONG MANY OTHER 8-STORY STRUCTURES WITHIN THE CENTRAL BUSINESS DISTRICT. A RETAIL STOREFRONT IS INCLUDED AT THE FIRST FLOOR WHILE 7 STORIES OF UNITS FIT NICELY WITHIN A MORE CONTEMPORARY STYLED BUILDING. THE CENTER PORTION ABOVE THE MAIN ENTRANCE ON CAMPBELL HAS A 7-STORY MODERN GLASS ELEMENT THAT BALANCES COMFORTABLY WITH THE TRADITIONAL ELEMENTS OF BRICK AND STONE ON THE REMAINDER OF THE BUILDING. THE HIGHLAND BUILDING IS THE TALLEST OF THE THREE BUILDINGS BECAUSE IT IS SET BACK THE FURTHEST FROM THE SURROUNDING NEIGHBORHOOD. THE 6-STORY BASE IS MASONRY TO MATCH THE VILLAGE GARAGE, AND THE UNITS ABOVE ARE A MIX OF MASONRY AND MORE MODERN ELEMENTS SUCH AS THE GLASS CURTAIN WALL. WE INTENTIONALLY DESIGNED THIS BUILDING TO BE SLIGHTLY MORE SHEIK AND MODERN, WHICH OFFERS A DIFFERENT LIFESTYLE THAN THE OTHER TWO BUILDINGS. WE MIGHT EXPECT THE INTERIORS TO BE INDUSTRIAL AND LOFTY IN DESIGN, AND A MORE VIBRANT AND EXCITING LIFESTYLE COULD BE DRAWN TO THIS TYPE OF BUILDING. LASTLY, IT SHOULD BE NOTED THAT THE INTRODUCTION OF THE GLASS CURTAIN WALLS, WHILE EXCITING AND DIFFERENT FROM TYPICALLY MASONRY CONSTRUCTION, OFFERS ANOTHER UNIQUE BENEFIT: IN ORDER TO SOFTEN AND LIGHTEN THE APPEARANCE OF A 12-STORY BUILDING, WE HAVE DELIBERATELY INTRODUCED LARGE EXPANSES OF GLASS THAT SOFTLY REFLECT THE SKY. MİRRORED-TYPE REFLECTED GLASS WILL NOT BE CONSIDERED, AND A MORE COMFORTABLY-TINTED AND ENVIRONMENTALLY FRIENDLY GLAZING SYSTEM WILL BE PROVIDED.**

ii. Consider extending the primary vertical brick piers from the garage below up through the

glass curtain walls to break up the large glass curtain walls and better integrate the garage with the tower above. **THE CURRENT DESIGNS WERE PRESENTED AT THE NEIGHBORHOOD MEETING ON SEPTEMBER 9<sup>TH</sup>. WE RECEIVED A VERY POSITIVE REACTION TO THE GLASS DESIGNS.**

iii. Also, consider extending some of the horizontal brick bands through the curtain wall area to help tie the glass curtain walls in with the main body of the building. **SEE ANSWER TO ii ABOVE.**

2. Clarify the types of glazing proposed for the curtain walls. Highly reflective glazing should be avoided to prevent glare on adjacent properties. **THIS WILL BE A PART OF OUR DESIGN REVIEW SUBMITTALS. WE WILL AVOID HIGHLY REFLECTIVE GLAZING**