APPROVED

MINUTES OF
THE VILLAGE OF ARLINGTON HEIGHTS
DESIGN COMMISSION MEETING
HELD AT THE ARLINGTON HEIGHTS MUNICIPAL BUILDING
33 S. ARLINGTON HEIGHTS RD.
AUGUST 9, 2016

Acting Chair Fitzgerald called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m.

Members Present: John Fitzgerald, Acting Chair

Anthony Fasolo Jonathan Kubow

Members Absent: Ted Eckhardt, Chair

Also Present: Jon Hague, Hague Architecture for *Kensington School*

Charles Marlas & Barbara Marlas for Kensington School

Steve Hautzinger, Staff Liaison

REVIEW OF MEETING MINUTES FROM JULY 26, 2016

A MOTION WAS MADE BY COMMISSIONER KUBOW, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER FASOLO, TO APPROVE THE MEETING MINUTES OF JULY 26, 2016. ALL WERE IN FAVOR. THE MOTION CARRIED.

ITEM 1. COMMERCIAL RE-REVIEW

DC#16-031 - Kensington School - 840 E. Kensington Rd.

Jon Hague, representing *Hague Architecture*, **Barbara Marlas**, founder of *Kensington School*, and **Charles Marlas**, were present on behalf of the project.

Mr. Hautzinger stated that with only 3 of the 4 commissioners here tonight, the project must be unanimously approved; however, the petitioner has the option to continue the project to the next meeting.

Mr. Hautzinger presented Staff comments. The petitioner is proposing to build a new 15,000 square foot, single-story preschool / children's day care center. The proposed development includes 54 on-grade parking spaces and a large fenced in playground area around the sides and rear of the building. The two acre site is currently vacant and it is located at the northwest corner of Kensington Road and Dryden Place within the Hickory Kensington Area. The property is zoned B-2, General Business District and is part of the existing Arlington Market Planned Unit Development. This proposal requires review by the Plan Commission and approval by the Village Board as a Special Use and for an amendment to the PUD.

This proposal was previously reviewed by the Design Commission on April 26, 2016. At that time, the Design Commission continued the project to allow the petitioner to work with Staff to resolve various site and building design issues. At this time, the petitioner has made revisions to their plans in preparation for Plan Commission review on August 24, and they are returning to the Design Commission seeking approval.

Mr. Hautzinger reviewed the comments and recommendations made by Staff, and the feedback from the commissioners when the project was last reviewed on April 26. In response to this feedback and continued discussions with Staff, the petitioner has revised their proposal with the following highlights:

<u>Architectural Design</u>. As an alternate to the originally proposed black asphalt shingle roofing, the Petitioner is proposing a standing seam metal roof in a dark gray color.

<u>Landscaped Plaza</u>. The building and parking has been shifted to the east to accommodate a continuous 20-foot wide pedestrian plaza along the west end of the site, versus 25 foot wide per the existing PUD and easement. The plaza includes a 6-foot wide concrete walkway with landscaping on both sides.

<u>Dryden/Kensington Focal Feature</u>. A 6-foot high, monument style "Kensington School" sign has been added to the corner of the site within a bed of landscaping.

<u>Trash Dumpster Enclosure</u>. The design of the trash enclosure has been changed from wood to brick construction to match the building with decorative black metal gates, and it has been shifted slightly to the south to allow landscaping on all sides.

<u>Fence</u>. The proposed fence has been changed from white vinyl PVC to a decorative black aluminum fence. The fence has been set back on all sides to allow continuous landscaping around the perimeter.

<u>Landscaping</u>. An abundance of landscaping has been added throughout the site including screening around the parking area, landscaping around the fence, landscaping along the pedestrian plaza, and landscaping along the north property line.

<u>Specialty Paving</u>. A herringbone brick pattern is shown within the crosswalks on the Landscape Plan, but it is unclear exactly what the specialty paving will be.

<u>Sustainability</u>. The following list of sustainable design features has been provided by the Petitioner:

- 1. Envelope The external envelope will be built tight and ventilated in good principle. The orientation of the building and glass permits natural day lighting.
- 2. Materials The building materials are all available from the US.
- 3. Green space More than 40% of the site is green space.
- 4. Water All fixtures are low use and dual flushing.
- 5. Mechanical Units All units are high efficiency.

Mr. Hautzinger reviewed Staff comments as they relate to the revisions submitted by the petitioner:

<u>Architectural Design</u>. Staff still questions the appropriateness of the proposed colonial style design in this location. At a minimum, Staff recommends approval of the proposed roofing change from asphalt shingles to a dark gray standing seam metal to help the design relate to the context of the adjacent retail buildings. Staff also recommends changing the white trim to a darker color for a less colonial appearance.

<u>Landscaped Plaza</u>. The proposed 20-foot wide pedestrian plaza accomplishes some of the spirit of the original PUD approval, providing a pleasant pedestrian connection through the site connecting the commercial properties to the south with the residential neighborhoods to the north.

<u>Dryden/Kensington Focal Feature</u>. A multi-tenant ground sign is preferred at the corner of the site. However, based on feedback from the Design Commission, Staff accepts the proposed monument style "Kensington School" at the corner. However, it is recommended that the height of the sign be restricted to 6-feet, and a mix of perennials be provided in front of the sign.

<u>Trash Dumpster Enclosure</u>. The proposed location of the trash enclosure is highly visible, and is not allowed within the front yard. Staff recommends that the trash enclosure be attached to the east side of the building, adjacent to the Kitchen. The Petitioner has indicated security concerns with trash collection inside the fenced yard, so Staff suggests jogging the fence to allow access to the trash area without entering the fenced yard. Additional tall evergreen landscaping should be provided on all sides of the trash enclosure to fully screen it from public view. Additionally, the black metal gates need a solid backing to block the view of the dumpsters.

<u>Site Lighting</u>. The proposed colonial style parking lot lights do not fit the modern character of the Hickory/Kensington area. The Design Guidelines include criteria for street lighting that are a modern, sculptural style, energy efficient LED light fixture, and dark sky compliant. It is recommended that the proposed colonial style parking lot light fixtures be changed to a more modern fixture that fits the character of the commercial area, and complies with the intent of the Design Guidelines.

Fence. The proposed decorative black aluminum fence will fit in well in this location.

<u>Landscaping</u>. It is recommended that groundcover be added within the center island, and that 3-foot high shrubs be added on the west end of the parking lot between the parking lot and the sidewalk.

<u>Specialty Paving</u>. The Petitioner needs to clarify what the specialty paving within the crosswalks will be, and additional specialty paving is recommended at the building entrance.

<u>Sustainability</u>. Additional sustainable features such as a rainwater collection system or bio-swales are encouraged.

Staff recommends the Design Commission approve the proposed design to include the 13 items listed in the Staff report.

Barbara Marlas said that she founded Kensington School in 1969 and would be pleased to bring their beautiful school concept to Arlington Heights. The proposed architecture is very important to them and they have worked closely with Staff. With regards to the garbage enclosure, she explained that parents are required to sign children out before going out to the yard with them, rather than opening the fence; so to have the fence opened for garbage collection would be something that would alarm them because of the possibility that the enclosure was not closed after garbage collection. They are not opposed to the standing seam roof; however, it is an additional \$50,000 cost, and the asphalt shingle roof is consistent with other buildings in the area. She concluded that this has been a 15-month project that they have invested a lot of heart into and she hoped for a positive vote tonight.

Commissioner Fasolo generally agreed with most of Staff comments. He felt the standing seam roof was a cleaner look and the only piece of the project that tied in to the existing retail. He was fine with the white trim color, which is the brand for the school, and he agreed that the ground sign should be limited to 6-feet in height with perennials provided in front of the sign. He supported the petitioner's proposed location of the trash enclosure, although it should be heavily landscaped with evergreens; he did not want to see the enclosure out in the middle of the play yard. He was in favor of the light fixtures being proposed, which fit in with the building, and he asked about the material for the crosswalks. The petitioner replied that stamped concrete was being proposed for the crosswalks, which Commissioner Fasolo felt would be easier to maintain than pavers. Commissioner Fasolo also agreed with Staff encouraging the petitioner to provide more sustainable design features on the site, and he suggested adding a feature to the northwest corner of the site. The petitioner replied that they were not opposed to working with Staff to incorporate some type of sustainable feature. Commissioner Fasolo concluded that the improvements made since the last review are nice and the new school would be a nice addition to the community.

Commissioner Kubow was struggling with the proposal and he questioned who was responsible for the enforcement of the Hickory/Kensington Design Guidelines. Because the site is zoned as a specific area, he was interested in hearing the Plan Commission's input on the contemporary/modern Design Guidelines. Part of him wanted to leave the architecture as previously presented in April because he felt it was a wonderful design and worked well for the school, and the other part of him wanted the petitioner to start over completely and do something incredibly contemporary, although he understood this probably did not work for the petitioner. He was completely on the fence and did not know what direction to go in and wondered what the Plan Commission thought about this project fitting into the Hickory/Kensington plan.

Mr. Hautzinger explained that the Plan Commission would be reviewing the use in this location and issues such as traffic and parking, but they will look to the Design Commission with regards to the aesthetic components of the Hickory/Kensington Guidelines. The only feedback he could provide at this time was that the project received general support from the a preliminary review with the Plat & Subdivision Committee.

Commissioner Kubow said his position today is that he agrees with all of the comments in the Staff report; he could support the originally proposed architecture, as well as the changes Staff is recommending. He was very much on the fence with this project and wanted to hear more discussion because he did not want the petitioner to have to table or re-design the project.

Acting Chair Fitzgerald said this was the first time he is seeing the project and he really liked it when he first saw it. He felt it was very interesting to have a school look like an early 1900's building, especially with newer buildings located to the north, as well as Stonegate. He liked the standing seam metal roof suggested by Staff, although it would not be a requirement for him, and he was fine with the current location of the trash enclosure and felt it would be one of the nicer trash enclosures in town. He asked Staff to clarify their suggestion for a darker trim color and Mr. Hautzinger replied that they were suggesting a dark bronze, similar to the redeveloped retail building to the west. Acting Chair Fitzgerald was not opposed to the darker color; however, he also liked the white trim being proposed because it would never go out of style and 100 years from now the building would still look good. He questioned the use of Austrian Pines, Inkberry and English Ivy for their heartiness in this area, and he agreed with Staff's suggestion to add 3-foot high shrubs on the west side of the parking lot. He disagreed with adding groundcover in the center

island because of cut-through from the parking lot, and he preferred to see grass in this area. He agreed with the suggestion to update the parking lot fixtures to a more modern style. Acting Chair Fitzgerald also said he was okay with the landscape plaza as presented, and he liked the sign as shown, and he supported the 6-foot height maximum. He felt the area inside the fence near the play area should be as simple as possible, instead of creating a bio-swale in the area, although adding rain barrels could be interesting and educational for the children. In conclusion, Acting Chair Fitzgerald liked the project and he was not opposed to having the traditional style building in an area that is going to be modern.

Commissioner Kubow pointed out that the site is in a transitional zone with more traditional to the east, and he felt the current design would be complimentary. Acting Chair Fitzgerald reiterated that this is a school and felt it would be nice that it would stand on its own or look like it has been there a long time.

Charles Marlas commented that in trying to decipher the Hickory/Kensington Design Guidelines, it was unclear to them whether the standing seam roof was needed, and he pointed out the Walgreens to the south that has an asphalt shingle roof. He said that they are not opposed to a standing seam roof, which could provide a modern twist to a building that looks like it was there before everything else in the area. Commissioner Kubow was struggling to see how a standing seam roof would fit with the type of architecture being proposed for the building; he felt an asphalt roof was the only direction to go with.

The commissioners reviewed and discussed each recommendation in the Staff report as follows:

1. The roofing should be 'musket gray' standing seam metal.

Commissioner Fasolo agreed. Commissioner Kubow & Acting Chair Fitzgerald said this was a recommendation for them.

2. Consider changing the trim color from white to a darker color.

The commissioners all agreed that white is acceptable as proposed.

3. The ground sign shall be limited to 6-feet in height.

The commissioners all agreed.

4. Provide a mix of perennials in front of the ground sign.

The commissioners all agreed.

5. Relocate the trash enclosure.

The commissioners all agreed that the currently proposed location was fine.

6. Add a solid black backing to the trash enclosure gates.

The commissioners all agreed.

7. Change the proposed colonial style parking lot light fixtures to a more modern fixture.

The commissioners all agreed that the colonial style light fixtures on the building are acceptable, but the light fixtures for the parking lot should be a mix of traditional and modern style.

8. Add ground cover within the center island.

The commissioners all felt this was not necessary.

9. Add 3-foot high shrubs on the west end of the parking lot between the parking lot and sidewalk.

The commissioners all agreed.

10. Clarify the specialty paving within the crosswalks and provide specialty paving at the building entrance. It was stated by the petitioner that the specialty paving within the crosswalks will be a reddish color stamped asphalt, color to be reviewed by Staff. Acting Chair Fitzgerald was not in favor of trying to exactly match the red color of the brick on the building.

11. Additional sustainable design features are encouraged.

The commissioners felt this should be a recommendation.

Acting Chair Fitzgerald asked that the motion include a recommendation to replace the Austrian Pine, Compact Inkberry Holly, and English Ivy with more hardy plants. The commissioners also re-visited the issue of the standing seam roof. Acting Chair Fitzgerald felt the standing seam roof should be a recommendation and Commissioner

Kubow was unsure how this type of roof would look on the traditional style building; he had trouble visualizing this. **Ms. Marlas** said that they still had concerns about how the modern aesthetics of the standing seam roof on the very traditional building; however, they would try to make it work if it were a recommendation. **Mr. Hautzinger** stated that the additional initial cost for a standing seam roof may result in long term cost savings over an asphalt shingle roof, and he reiterated that the issue of the roof relates to the context in this location. **Mr. Marlas** reiterated that the Walgreens building located one block south of the site has an asphalt shingle roof. **Commissioner Fasolo** liked that the style of asphalt shingle roof being proposed which is an upgrade to a standard asphalt shingle.

A MOTION WAS MADE BY COMMISSIONER FASOLO, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER KUBOW, TO APPROVE THE ARCHITECTURAL DESIGN FOR *KENSINGTON SCHOOL* LOCATED AT 840 E. KENSINGTON ROAD. THIS APPROVAL IS BASED ON THE REVISED PLANS RECEIVED ON 7/22/16, DESIGN COMMISSION RECOMMENDATIONS, COMPLIANCE WITH ALL APPLICABLE FEDERAL, STATE, AND VILLAGE CODES, REGULATIONS, AND POLICIES, THE ISSUANCE OF ALL REQUIRED PERMITS, AND THE FOLLOWING:

- 1. A REQUIREMENT THAT THE ROOF BE ASPHALT SHINGLES AS SUBMITTED.
- 2. A REQUIREMENT THAT THE TRIM COLOR BE WHITE AS SUBMITTED.
- 3. A REQUIREMENT THAT THE GROUND SIGN BE LIMITED TO 6-FEET IN HEIGHT.
- A REQUIREMENT THAT THERE BE A MIX OF PERENNIALS IN FRONT OF THE GROUND SIGN.
- A REQUIREMENT TO KEEP THE TRASH ENCLOSURE IN THE LOCATION AS PROPOSED.
- 6. A REQUIREMENT TO ADD A SOLID BLACK BACKING TO THE TRASH ENCLOSURE GATES.
- 7. A REQUIREMENT TO KEEP THE COLONIAL STYLE LIGHT FIXTURES ON THE BUILDING AS PROPOSED, AND WORK WITH STAFF ON SELECTING NEW LIGHT FIXTURES FOR THE PARKING LOT THAT ARE A MIX OF TRADITIONAL AND MODERN STYLE.
- 8. A REQUIREMENT TO ADD 3-FOOT HIGH SHRUBS ON THE WEST END OF THE PARKING LOT BETWEEN THE PARKING LOT AND THE SIDEWALK.
- 9. A REQUIREMENT TO HAVE STAMPED ASPHALT AT THE TWO CROSSWALKS, COLOR TO BE SIMILAR BUT NOT MATCHING THE BRICK COLOR ON THE BUILDING.
- 10. A REQUIREMENT TO REPLACE THE AUSTRIAN PINE, COMPACT INKBERRY HOLLY, AND ENGLISH IVY WITH MORE HARDY PLANTS.
- 11. A RECOMMENDATION TO ADD MORE SUSTAINABLE DESIGN FEATURES, SUCH AS RAINWATER COLLECTION OR BIO-SWALES IN THE NORTHWEST QUADRANT OF THE SITE.
- 12. THIS REVIEW DEALS WITH ARCHITECTURAL DESIGN ONLY AND SHOULD NOT BE CONSTRUED TO BE AN APPROVAL OF, OR TO HAVE ANY OTHER IMPACT ON, ANY OTHER ZONING AND/OR LAND USE ISSUES OR DECISIONS THAT STEM FROM ZONING, BUILDING, SIGNAGE OR ANY OTHER REVIEWS. IN ADDITION TO THE NORMAL TECHNICAL REVIEW, PERMIT DRAWINGS WILL BE REVIEWED FOR CONSISTENCY WITH THE DESIGN COMMISSION AND ANY OTHER COMMISSION OR BOARD APPROVAL CONDITIONS. IT IS THE PETITIONER'S RESPONSIBILTY TO INCORPORATE ALL REQUIREMENTS LISTED ON THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS INTO THE PERMIT DRAWINGS, AND TO ENSURE THAT BUILDING PERMIT PLANS AND SIGN PERMIT PLANS COMPLY WITH ALL ZONING CODE, BUILDING CODE AND SIGN CODE REQUIREMENTS.
- 13. COMPLIANCE WITH ALL APPLICABLE FEDERAL, STATE AND VILLAGE CODES, REGULATIONS AND POLICIES.

Mr. Hautzinger asked the commissioners for their feedback on requiring or recommending decorative paving in lieu of plain concrete at the main entrance. Commissioner Fasolo agreed. Commissioner Kubow said the petitioner could work with Staff on some type of decorative approach at the front door, whether it be stamped asphalt or concrete, or pavers. Acting Chair Fitzgerald was in favor of stamped asphalt at the main entrance to match what was already going to be selected, or pavers; he did not like introducing stamped concrete next to stamped asphalt. He also had no problem with standard concrete as proposed. Commissioner Fasolo said that stamped asphalt cannot be used at the building entrance.

A MOTION WAS MADE BY COMMISSIONER FASOLO, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER KUBOW, TO AMEND THE MOTION AS FOLLOWS:

14. A RECOMMENDATION THAT THE PETITIONER STUDY DECORATIVE PAVING AT THE MAIN ENTRANCE, PREFERABLY PAVERS.

Mr. Hautzinger also said that if the trash enclosure remains in the location proposed, then Staff would recommend additional landscaping around it, specifically taller evergreen shrubs. Acting Chair Fitzgerald said that the proposed Boston Ivy should be replaced with taller upright evergreens to partially screen the trash enclosure.

A MOTION WAS MADE BY COMMISSIONER FASOLO, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER KUBOW, TO AMEND THE MOTION TO ADD THE FOLLOWING:

15. A REQUIREMENT TO REPLACE THE 18 BOSTON IVY PLANTINGS AROUND THE TRASH ENCLOSURE WITH A TALLER EVERGREEN, APPROXIMATELY ½ THE HEIGHT OF THE ENCLOSURE OR APPROXIMATELY 3-FEET.

FASOLO, AYE; KUBOW, AYE; FITZGERALD, AYE. ALL WERE IN FAVOR. MOTION CARRIED.